

ISABELLA COUNTY, MICHIGAN

PLANNING COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING

MONDAY, SEPTEMBER 23, 2019

7:00 P.M.

APPROVED:


Tim O'Neil, Secretary

PLANNING COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Jeremy Murphy, Chairperson

Kelly Bean, Vice-Chair

Tim O'Neil, Secretary

Ann Silker, Commissioner

Bob Campbell, Commissioner

Jim Horton, Commissioner

Jerry Neyer, Commissioner (Excused - due to conflict)

Nathan Rogers, Commissioner (Not present - conflict exists)

Phillip Vogel, Commissioner (Excused - due to conflict)

(Quorum present.)

COUNTY REPRESENTATIVES:

Tim Nieporte, Community Development Director

Ray Johnson, Planner/Zoning Administrator

William Fahey, County Attorney

ALSO PRESENT:

Alan Bean (Spicer Group)

Jennifer Clawson (Spicer Group)

MINUTES RECORDED BY:

Quentina R. Snowden, (CSR-5519)

Certified Shorthand Reporter & Notary Public

1. CALL TO ORDER: Chairperson Murphy called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.
2. Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

3. Approval of Agenda

Motion to approve the agenda

Motion: Neyer

Support: Horton

Abstained: (None.)

Opposed: (None.)

(All Ayes to approve the agenda.)

4. Minutes from the August 28, 2019 Meeting

Motion to approve minutes from August 28, 2019 meeting

Motion: Silker

Support: Campbell

Abstained: (None.)

Opposed: (None.)

(All Ayes to approve the minutes.)

5. Public Comments (None.); Opened at 7:02 p.m., closed at 7:02 p.m.
6. Conflict of Interest Declarations

Attorney Fahey stated the following Planning Commissioners have no conflict of interest:

Chairperson Jeremy Murphy; Vice-Chair Kelly Bean (nephew Todd Bean lives within the project's notice area. Brother Jeff Bean received notice of the project, but only by virtue of his position as the Vernon Township Supervisor - no personal financial interest nor property); Secretary Tim O'Neil; Commissioner Jim Horton; Commissioner Ann Silker; Commissioner Bob Campbell.

He stated the following Planning Commissioners have a conflict of interest:

Commissioner Jerry Neyer (brother owns property that is leased for the project); Commissioner Phillip Vogel (owns property as a member of an LLC that is leased for the project); Commissioner Nathan Rogers (owns property within the project's notice area and within 300 feet of the project area.)

He stated pursuant to the bylaws, a Planning Commission Member must disqualify himself/herself based upon a conflict of interest. (Commissioners with conflicts exited the hearing room.)

7. Site Plan Review #19-10 Wind Energy Conversation System (WECS) Isabella Wind LLC

- a. Nottawa Township

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed there are 77 Wind turbine sites in Nottawa Township.

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 1 (Turbines F09, F10, F11):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailement required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (Turbine F09 NRO mode 1, Turbine F10 NRO mode 3, Turbine F11 NRO mode 2.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 2 (Turbine F08):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbine complies.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbine complies.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailed required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (NRO Mode 2)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 3 (Turbines F07, F06):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailed required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (Turbine F06 NRO mode 2; Turbine F07 Turbine complies - normal operation.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 4 (Turbine F05):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbine complies.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbine complies.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (Normal operation for turbine F05.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 5 (Turbines F01, F02, F03 and F04):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required for Turbine F01 only.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (F01, F02 and F03 - all normal operation; NRO Mode 2 for Turbine F04.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 8 (Turbines E01, E02, E03):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (E01, E02 - all normal operation; NRO Mode 1 for Turbine E03.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 10 (Turbines E04, E05, E06, E07 and E08):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailed required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (E04, E05 and E06 and E08 - all normal operation; NRO Mode 1 for Turbine F07.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 11 (Turbines E09 and E10):

Mr. Alan Bean discussed the collection line and access road which appear to be sited along a non-participating line.

Mr. Albert Jongewaard stated he's familiar with this particular parcel, and they have requested that the road be located on their property. He stated as they go through with the ALTA data, they have to verify they are in compliance and not interfering with the unsigned property. He stated that road will be located kind of in coordination and in conjunction with the underground collection system and that will all be located on the farm a distance away from the property line so it's not going to be touching or on that property line.

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailed required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line.

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 12 (Turbines E12, E13, E14):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (E12, E13, and E14 - all normal operation.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 13 (Turbine D15):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbine complies.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbine complies.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (NRO Mode 2)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 14 (Turbines D10, D11, D12, D13, D14):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (D10 NRO Mode 1; D11, D12, D12, D13, D14 - all normal operation.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 15 (Turbines D07, D08, D09):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (D07 And D08 - normal operation; D09 NRO Mode 1.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 16 (Turbine D06):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbine complies.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbine complies.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (Normal operation.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 17 (Turbines D01, D02, D03, D04 and D05.):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailed required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (D01 and D03 NRO Mode 3; D02 and D05 NRO Mode 1; D04 NORO Mode 2.)

Mr. Alan Bean noted there is a cell tower 1,300 feet away, and that it is in compliance with the zoning requirements.

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 20 (Turbines C01, C02, C03, C04, C05 and C06):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailed required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (C01, C02 and C04 - normal operation; C03 NRO Mode 3; C05 NRO Mode 2; C06 NRO Mode 1.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 21 (Turbines C07 and C08):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (C07 NRO Mode 2; C08, NRO Mode 1.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 22 (Turbines C09, C10 and C11):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (C09 and C10 NRO Mode 3; C11 normal operation.)

Mr. Alan Bean discussed the access roads. He stated they are close to a non-participating property in the southeast corner of the section. He stated they will confirm the siting with the ALTA data.

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 23 (Turbine C12):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbine complies.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbine complies.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (Normal operation.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 24 (Turbines C13, C14 and C15):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (C13 and C15 NRO Mode 2; C14 - normal operation.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 25 (Turbines B12 and B13):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (B12 - normal operation; B13 NRO Mode 2.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 26 (Turbines B08, B09, B10, B11):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line.

Mr. Alan Bean pointed out the access road is going to continue west from B11 to get to the property line and then continue westward along the underground powerline to B09.

Mr. Albert Jongewaard affirmed. He stated he's not sure why it doesn't show on the site map, but they can go back and amend it.

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 27 (Turbine B07):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbine complies.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbine complies.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (Normal operation.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 28 (Turbines B02, B03 B04 and B05):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailed required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (B02 and B04 NRO Mode 3; B03 NRO Mode 2; B05 NRO Mode 1.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 29 (Turbine B01):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbine complies.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbine complies.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbine complies.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailed required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (NRO Mode 1.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 34 (Turbines A01 A02, A03 and A04):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailed required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (A01 NRO Mode 1; A02 normal operation; A3 and A4 NRO Mode 2.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 35 (Turbines A05 and A06):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (A05 NRO Mode 2; A06 - normal operation.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Nottawa Township, Section 36 (Turbines A07, A08, A09 and A10):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (A07 and A09 NRO Mode 2; A08 and A10 - normal operation.)

Mr. Nieporte questioned whether the access road in Section 26 needs to be addressed in the resolution.)

Attorney Fahey stated it is intended to be a part of the last requirement; that when they receive the ALTA information, those are the details they would have to show.

He discussed the document entitled: The Decision Granting Partial Site Plan Approval with Conditions - Nottawa Township Portions of Isabella Wind Energy Project. He discussed in detail the Findings, Conclusions and Conditions.

Motion to approve and grant Partial Site Plan with conditions (Nottawa Township) .

Motion: Bean Support: O'Neil

Abstained: (*See below) Opposed: (None.)

ROLL CALL VOTE:

(All eyes to approve motion - Chair Murphy, Vice-Chair Bean, Secretary O'Neil, Commissioner Horton, Commissioner Silker, Commissioner Campbell.

***Commissioners Neyer, Vogel and Rogers were disqualified/abstained**

8. Site Plan Review #19-10 Wind Energy Conversation System (WECS) Isabella Wind LLC

b. Gilmore Township

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Gilmore Township, Section 25 (Turbines H06, H07 and H08):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (Normal operation for all.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Gilmore Township, Section 26 (Turbines H03, H04 and H05 and a MET tower):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.) MET tower excluded.

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (H03 and H05 NRO Mode 1; H04 NRO Mode 3.) MET tower excluded.

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Gilmore Township, Section 27 (Turbines H01 and H02):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailed required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (NRO Mode 2 for H01 and H02.)

Mr. Alan Bean had a question of Mr. Jongeward about Turbine H01 being in a wooded lot.

Mr. Albert Jongewaard stated he needs to double-check the specifics of the site. He discussed the fact that they are reviewing 150 turbines, but at the end of the day will only be building 136.

Mr. Alan Bean discussed Section 28, that the shadow flicker contour does project into this section, but there are no structures to review to approve. He discussed Section 32 has a similar situation in the southeast, the sound contour coming off of Section 33 goes down to the southwest of that area.

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Gilmore Township, Section 33 (Turbines G01, G02, G03, G04, G05):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailed required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (G01 and G03 NRO Mode 3; G02 and G05 - normal operation; G04 NRO Mode 2.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Gilmore Township, Section 35 (Turbines G06, G07, G08, G09):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Turbines comply.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (G06 NRO Mode 1; G07 and G09 NRO Mode 2; G07 NRO Mode 3.)

MR. ALAN BEAN discussed Gilmore Township, Section 36 (Turbines G10 and G11):

Setback from Non-participating property lines

Requirement 582 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Requirement from Public Roads

Requirement 1.5 tower height - 874 Feet (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height from a Railroad

Requirement 1.5 tower height (Turbines comply.)

Tower Height Occupied buildings

Requirement 2.5 tower height - 1,165 feet (Turbines comply.)

Above-ground utility lines

Setback requirement 30 feet (Turbines comply.)

Shadow Flicker

Requirement - no more than 30 hours per year on an occupied building. (Curtailment required.)

Sound

50 dBA at a non-participating property line. (Normal operation for both.)

Attorney Fahey stated there are two decisions; one dealing with the principal wind turbines and a separate one for the MET towers.

He discussed the document entitled: Isabella County Planning Commission Decision Granting Partial Site Plan Approval with Conditions - Gilmore Township Portions of Isabella Wind Energy Project. He discussed in detail the Findings, Conclusions and Conditions.

Motion to approve and grant Partial Site Plan with conditions (Gilmore Township).

Motion: Horton Support: Bean
Abstained: (*See below) Opposed: (None.)

ROLL CALL VOTE:

(All ayes to approve motion - Chair Murphy, Vice-Chair Bean, Secretary O'Neil, Commissioner Horton, Commissioner Silker, Commissioner Campbell.

*Commissioners Neyer, Vogel and Rogers were disqualified/abstained

Motion to approve and grant MET towers Partial Site Plan with conditions (Gilmore Township).

Motion: Horton Support: O'Neil
Abstained: (*See below) Opposed: (None.)

ROLL CALL VOTE:

(All ayes to approve motion - Chair Murphy, Vice-Chair Bean, Secretary O'Neil, Commissioner Horton, Commissioner Silker, Commissioner Campbell.

*Commissioners Neyer, Vogel and Rogers were disqualified/abstained

8. Public Comment (Opened at 7:57 p.m.)

Mr. George Green approached, stating he lives in Section 1 in Notttawa Township. He wanted to get an understanding of the MET towers, whether the ones in place currently will be removed.

Mr. Albert Jongewaard stated the existing MET towers were put up to help get data of wind speeds, times of year and times of day, how the wind is blowing, how forcefully. He stated they used that a lot to figure out the design and the layout of the turbine locations. He stated they also have to have that data so they can prove that they have a viable project. He stated at the end of the day, they don't need to continue measuring those wind speeds throughout the entire project footprint, and they want to have just two permanent MET towers in place. He confirmed that they will be there for the life of the project.

(Public comment was closed at 8:01 p.m.)

10. Adjournment - Motion by Horton; Support by Bean to adjourn;
(All ayes to adjourn.)

(Meeting adjourned at 8:01 p.m.)

Minutes certified by:



/s/ Quentina Rochelle Snowden, CSR-5519

Certified on: September 29, 2019

QRS Court Reporting, LLC

800.308.0068 (o)

810.691.4226 (after hours/emergencies)